

Education and Training Evaluation for Apparatus in Regional Public Hospital

Rusmasari Marisya, Maruf Akbar, Moch. Asmawi

ABSTRACT: *The aim of this research was to evaluate the education and training of human resources apparatus at a Regional Public Hospital in Indonesia. It was conducted through the use of a qualitative method by applying the Context, Input, Process, Product (CIPP) model, with four different stages: Context, Input, Process, and Product. Moreover, Kirkpatrick evaluation model was conducted to examine the capability improvement of the medical officers. The data obtained through questionnaire and the documents needed regarding the implementation of training and education. The respondents are 15 managerial officers in the hospital including directors and head of division. The result of the study showed the Context, Input, Process, and Product for the training and education provided by the hospital are very good. Then, it was concluded that the hospital still need to provide the training and education program for apparatus is still crucial for the a Hospital which not only offer the medical service but also some medical degrees in Indonesia.*

Key Words: *Competency based training; Human Resources Management; Hospital; Training and Education Evaluation.*

INTRODUCTION

The Regional Public Hospital Ulin Banjarmasin has the main task to carry out medical services, health education, research and community services. As Regional Public Service Agency (BLUD), the implementation of individual health services effectively and efficiently through curative and rehabilitative services carried out through education, training, research and development (Katuwo, Idris, & Kusuma, 2014).

However, there are a number of issues surrounding Human Resources (HR) to conduct education, training, research and development for the implementation of effective and efficient health services in Regional Public Hospital Ulin Banjarmasin. These problems were found in the 2011-2015 period, seen on its strategic plan report.

Firstly, the HR commitment of Ulin Regional Public Hospital is still not optimal yet in terms of customer-oriented services (Fakhsiannor, 2017).

The urgency of increasing the quality of employees' needs to be in a planned, directed and sustainable manner in order to improve the capabilities of its organization. The goal of employee quality development is to improve the performance in Ulin Regional Public Hospital (Fakhsianoor & Dewi, 2014). In addition, the high quality of employee resources will lead to a strong commitment in completing routine tasks according to their respective responsibilities

and higher functions effectively, and productively (Ozolina-Ozola, 2014). The low productivity of these employees is caused by a lack of skills aspect. We identified three types of skills weaknesses inherent in Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital employees in South Kalimantan, namely: a) Managerial ability, it's a lack of leadership ability to move subordinates, coordinate and decisions making (Brown, Gray, McHardy, & Taylor, 2015); b) Technical ability, the lack of ability to skillfully to complete the task efficiently; and d) Technological capability, which is a lack of ability to utilize the results of technological discoveries in the tasks execution such as Automatic Data Processing (ADP) or Electronic Data Processing (EDP).

Secondly, the Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital's organizational culture has not yet formed a human resource with a customer-oriented mindset. In fact, Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital has now conducted education and training in capacity building of the operational through training and development of HR organizational in response to anticipating a change in environment and fast phase customer's demands.

Third, the HR of Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital entrepreneur spirit has not been maximized yet. This needs to be stated because in the future the problems and challenges that will be faced by Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital in South Kalimantan will be more severe and complex, for example related to the ASEAN Economic Community (AEC) which has been effective since the end of 2015, so that, it takes the resources of employees who are good in anticipating various problems.

Fourth, the organizational structure of the Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital is not in accordance with the Regional Public Service Agency (BLUD) organizational structure, the company's organization according to the current mindset is a collection of various resources, capabilities, and competencies that can later be used to form a particular market position. Thus, needs serious attention is that the management of the company is able to create core capabilities and competencies that are difficult to imitate competitors in order to achieve the desired competitive advantage.

Fifth, the management of Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital has hard experienced reliable recruitment of specialist doctors and paramedics because it is related to the limitations of Civil Servants formation and the growing number of Private Hospitals with certain excellent services.

Sixth, the Management Operational Standard of Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital has not set the well

Revised Manuscript Received on April 15, 2019.

Rusmasari Marisya, Human Resources Management Student, Post-graduate Program, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia. (rusmasarimasrisya@gmail.com)

Maruf Akbar, Faculty Post-graduate Program, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia. (marufakbar@unj.ac.id)

Moch. Asmawi, Faculty Post-graduate Program, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia. (moch.asmawi@unj.ac.id)

scheduled related to the maintenance of hospital equipment so that the utilization rate becomes less optimal. This means that the implications of globalization on HR management at Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital still seem to be disproportionately lacking in direct relevance with the special strategy of Ulin Banjarmasin Hospital in South Kalimantan.

In fact, the role of HR in supporting the implementation of Strategic Business Unit (SBU) and functional corporate strategy is very important and decisive. The discussion of HR development, in the context of the sixth issue, can actually be seen from two aspects, namely quantity and quality. Definition of quantity concerns the number of human resources. The quantity of human resources without being accompanied by good quality skills will be a burden on the organization. While the quality, related to the quality of human resources related to ability, both physical ability and non-physical ability such as intelligence and mental. Therefore, efforts to improve the quality of human resources can be directed at both aspects. To determine physical quality can be pursued through education and training to improve welfare and nutrition. While to improve non-physical quality, education and training efforts are needed. This effort is meant by HR development.

But on the other hand that happened at Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital in South Kalimantan, the development of employees often received less attention. The existence of constraints regarding the development of the ability of employee's causes the quality of work tends not to be practiced. The quality performance of employees is still less visible in terms of accuracy and speed and the results of the work carried out are not in accordance with what is expected. This shows the neglect of efficient aspects and of course also not effective

Seeing the problems encourages researchers to conduct evaluations education and training to improve the capability of human resources apparatus in Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital, South Kalimantan. It is expected that the evaluation can produce examples, and as an improvement in Ulin Hospital services to customers.

To be able to formulate the focus of the research, the researcher has made several visits or grand tour to obtain data from Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital, South Kalimantan.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Evaluation is a process of determining price benefits and the value of something and evaluation is the product of the process of determining the benefits and value of something (Stufflebeam & Shinkfield, 2007). The product is shaped in the form of findings written in the form of reports. Moreover, it is noted that the term evaluation is a systematic process to determine or make decisions, to what extent the goals of education and training have been achieved (Djaali & Muljono, 2008).

In the education sector, the terms "evaluation", "assessment" and "measurement" are known. The three terms are often used interchangeably for the same purpose. The three terms above are interrelated. However, all three have different meanings. Measurement is the process of comparing something with a unit scale of measure

(quantitative). Assessment is the process of making decisions about something of good or bad measuring base (qualitative). The assessment is on the basis of measurement results. While, evaluation covers both activities measurement and assessment (Arikunto, 2012).

Organizational capability evaluation, of course, aims to ensure the achievement of the goals and objectives of the organization. In addition, the purpose of the evaluation is to determine the position of the organization and the achievements that have been achieved by employees as human resources.

Evaluation of Education and Training in improving the capability of apparatus resources is very useful to find out the problems that occur in the organization. It is also useful to create a competent workforce regarding the tight competition in this era (Madsihit, Asmawi, & Madhakomala, 2018).

The Ulin Hospital is a Public hospital which the employees are state officers. The apparatus is one of the most important factors in a government institution besides other factors such as money, technology-based tools such as computers and the internet. Therefore the apparatus resources must be well managed to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of government organizations to realize employee professionalism in doing work.

Based on the explanation above, it is necessary to conduct education and training evaluations to provide complete information of apparatus in enhancing the capability of apparatus resources in Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital. For that, select the CIPP evaluation model developed by Daniel Stufflebeam in 1966 tht commonly used in Indonesia (Andika Thio Rahman, Irianto, & Rosidi, 2018; Maulana, Supriyono, & Hermawan, 2013).

This CIPP evaluation model consists of 4 types of evaluation, such as: Context Context evaluation, Input evaluation, Process evaluation, Product evaluation. Evaluation Model CIPP model is linear, meaning that evaluation of input must be preceded by context evaluation, process evaluation must be preceded by evaluation of input.

a. Context Evaluation

Context evaluation is an assessment of the environment in which an innovation or program will be used, to determine the needs and objectives for innovation and also identify factors in the environment that will have an impact on the successful use. This analysis is often used as a basic for assessment needs, and is used in making decisions in program planning . According to the CIPP Stufflebeam model, evaluators must be present from the beginning of the project, and must assist in conducting assessments needs.

b. Input Evaluation

The second step of component in CIPP model is input evaluation. Here, the evaluation question is raised about the resources that will be used to develop and carry out the innovation program. Who are the people or participants, funds, space and equipment that will be available for the project? Will this be enough to produce the desired results?



Is the conceptualization of the program adequate? Will the program design produce the desired results? Is the program has expected benefit to be greater than the prospective innovation / program cost ?, This type of evaluation is helpful in making decisions in structuring the program. The evaluator must play as key role in the input evaluation.

c. Process Evaluation

The third component of CIPP is process evaluation. This is closely related to formative evaluation. Process evaluation is used to examine the way in which an innovation or program is developed, how it is implemented, and the initial effectiveness, and effectiveness after revision. Collected data to inform the project / program (and personnel or people involved) about the status of the project in how it is implemented, whether it meets legal and conceptual guidelines, and how the innovation was revised to meet the implementation objectives. Process evaluation is used in the making of implementation decisions.

d. Product Evaluation

The fourth component of CIPP is product evaluation. It focuses on the success of program innovation in producing desired results. Product evaluations include measuring outcome variables determined in program objectives, identifying unwanted results, assessing service programs, and conducting cost analyzes. Product evaluation is used when making summative evaluation decisions, for example, for what are the overall and feasible benefits from education and training? And should it continue?

RESEARCH METHOD

The research method used in this evaluation research is the CIPP Evaluation model with the stages of Context, Input, Process and Products which are the components of Evaluation. Training and education evaluations improve human resource capabilities using the CIPP evaluation model and Kirkpatrick's of four level models as a measure of the performance capabilities of participants who have finished attending education and training. The use of Kirkpatrick's four-level evaluation model is more comprehensive and effective to describe, obtain and present information that is very useful for assessing alternative education and training decisions. Data collection uses observation, interview, documentation and triangulation techniques. Performance of each aspects of evaluation will have compared with evaluation criteria's. The respondent are 15 the key persons in Hospital including the Director, vice directors, and Head of Department. The first step, The CIPP questionnaire, deep interviewed, and document analysis was conducted from August 2017-November 2017. After the results of CIPP anlysis obtained, The Kirkpatrick's four-level evaluation was conducted to obtained moe comprehensive findings.

Data analysis techniques used are Miles and Huberman techniques (2005: 56), there are; data reduction, data display, and conclusion by the triangulation process (Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2013).

ANALYSIS

Based on research on educational evaluation and training on capability improvement of apparatus of Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital in South Kalimantan, the researcher present the findings in 4 stages based on the CIPP Model Evaluation Program (the Context, Input, Process, and Product stages) as follows:

1) Context Components, which is an evaluation carried out on: 1) Legal Basis with Educational and Training Objectives, Evaluation Criteria are met, Assessment is categorized as "High". Decisions can be made where the basic aspects of law planning and organizing can be maintained and developed. 2) Clear and specific objectives in education and training, can be measured, describe the attainable, result oriented. Evaluation criteria can be fulfilled when assessment is categorized as "High". Decisions can be made where aspects of education and training goals can be maintained and developed.

2) Input Components, namely evaluations carried out on: 1) Organization Structure, 2) Planning and Organizing, Evaluation Criteria fulfilled, Assessment is categorized as "High". Decisions can be made where aspects of Organizational Structure and Planning and organizing, through education and training as an effort to improve the apparatus resources at Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital can be maintained and developed.

3) Process Components, which are evaluations carried out on: 1) Types of capability of apparatus resources improvement activities, having various activities to improve the apparatus resources capabilities as an effort to improve employee skills, among others: a. improvement of infrastructure facilities, b. employee book in modules form, c. education and training regular schedules, d. has the coverage of core competencies, e. have a learning method, f. have basic needs. g. has a format design for improving apparatus resource capability, h. benefits after attending education and training. i. utilization of training and education, and j. needs for the purpose and basis of education and training in improving the capability for apparatus resources. Evaluation Criteria are met, the assessment is categorized as "high" in terms of the aspects of organizational needs so that it can lead to decision taken as needs aspects are always considered to be developed and maintained for organization's needs.

4) Product Components, the evaluations carried out on: 1) competitive advantage through apparatus human resources (HR personnel), among others; a. proper use of personnel, b. profit consciousness, c. innovativeness, d. fair treatment, e. technical expertise, f. decision making skill, g. motivating skill, h. system development. Evaluation Criteria are met, in terms of system development from apparatus resources in Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital is categorized as "High". Thus, decisions can be made regarding aspects of employee competitive advantage can be applied and increased.

RESULT

Based on the findings and discussion of the results of the evaluation through education and training in improving the capabilities of apparatus human resources in Banjarmasin, South Kalimantan, the results achievement by education and training for apparatus human resources at Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital after attending training education by using Kirk Patrick evaluation model or known as the Model Four Levels which was developed by Donald L. Kirkpatrick. It calls Four Level because it is developed based on the learning sequences or learning experienced by someone (individual). Evaluation is done sequentially starting from the reaction, learning, behavior, to the results. The results descriptions of the evaluation through Kirk Patrick model for education and training participants, as follows;

1. **Reaction**, at Level 1 is carried out to measure the level of reaction designed to find out the opinions of trainees and education about training and education programs. In this level, data collection methods are used as a benchmark for achieving improvement in the capabilities / participant's performance in Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital apparatus HR by looking at the performance of participants after attending education and training. The training and education that has been followed and carried out by many participants has benefited especially as an improvement in the quality of service quality of Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital towards customers. This can be seen from the performance capabilities applied after attending education and training.
2. **Learning**, on Level 2 is carried out to determine the extent of the ability to increase the knowledge, skills and attitudes of participants towards training and education in the training material provided. In this level aims to see and find out how the knowledge absorption of materials that has been given and also before the material is given, so that the evaluation data shows results comparison by measuring before and after training and education followed by each trainee. This is an achievement in improving Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital apparatus human resources capability.
3. **Behavior**, at Level 3 this is a learning evaluation continuation because it refers to the attitude or performance of the participants who attend the education and training program after they returning to the workplace at Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital. Therefore this measurement can only be done for participants who have a positive reaction towards training and education that is followed according to their fields and abilities. Based on the above understanding, behavioral evaluation is also an outcome evaluation, as a determinant of education and training achievement to improve the quality of services towards customers.
4. **Results**, at Level 4 the coverage of participants' results on education and training can be reviewed including desired work results, higher work quality, increased participants capability who had attended training and education. Employees' capability improvements can also be seen in terms of lives of workers, improvement in human relations, improvement in organizational

communication, and improvement in quality services towards customers, higher morale employee, less accident rates, increase the job satisfaction, and most importantly profits increase.

CONCLUSIONS

1. The comprehensive training and education on human capabilities of the apparatus, which are carried out and designed as the organizational needs in Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital need to be improved and adjusted to the needs. The education and training to improve human resources has beneficial for participants who had attended, seeing the improvement of human resource capabilities, rising of services quality towards customers of Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital.
2. Learning or training and education materials, need to be improved and adjusted according to the participants competency/human resources of the apparatus competency. The absorption capacity of the participants' knowledge, skills and attitudes gained after participating in training and education, as an achievement of improving the capabilities of the apparatus in Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital.
3. By enhancing the capabilities of human resources of Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital through training and education, the apparatus' behavior become more optimal. The behavior of the apparatus in carrying out its role as human resources needs to be maintained by reviewing and evaluating its performance.
4. The optimal achievement or success in improving the capability of human resources in Ulin Banjarmasin Regional Public Hospital through education training needs to be evaluated and developed as an effort to increase the services quality towards consumers/customers to face global market competition.

REFERENCES

1. Andika Thio Rahman, R., Irianto, G., & Rosidi. (2018). Evaluation of E-Budgeting Implementation in Provincial Government of DKI Jakarta Using CIPP Model Approach. *Journal of Accounting and Investment*, 20(1). <https://doi.org/10.18196/jai.2001110>
2. Arikunto, S. (2012). *Dasar Dasar Evaluasi Pendidikan (Basic Evaluation Education)*. Bumi Aksara.
3. Brown, S., Gray, D., McHardy, J., & Taylor, K. (2015). Employee trust and workplace performance. *Journal of Economic Behavior and Organization*, 116, 361–378. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2015.05.001>
4. Djaali, & Muljono, P. (2008). *Pengukuran dalam Bidang Pendidikan (Measurement in Education Field)*. Jakarta: PT Grasindo.
5. Fakhshiannor. (2017). Hubungan Tingkat Kepuasan Pasien Miskin Pengguna Bpjs Terhadap Kinerja Pelayanan Kesehatan Di Rsud Ulin Banjarmasin Tahun 2016 (Poor People Satisfaction and Sericw Quality of Ulin Public Hospital in 2016). *As Siyasa*, 2(1), 51–54.
6. Fakhshiannor, & Dewi, S. (2014). Hubungan Antara Stres Kerja Dengan Burnout Pada Perawat Di Ruang Icu, Iccu Dan Picu Rsud Ulin Banjarmasin (The Impact of Work



- Stress on
Burnout for The Nurses in Ulin Public Hospital). *An-Nadaa*, 1(1), 10–13.
7. Katuwo, M. A., Idris, A., & Kusuma, A. R. (2014). Evaluasi Kinerja Blud Rsud Taman Husada Kota Bontang (Performance Evaluation on Taman Husada Public Hospital, Bontang City). *EJournal Administrative Reform*, 2(3), 2068–2079.
 8. Madsihit, Asmawi, M., & Madhakomala, R. (2018). POLICY IMPLEMENTATION EVALUATION OF THE TRAINING MANAGEMENT OF RIAU ISLANDS PROVINCE'S TRAINING CENTER. *Indonesian Journal of Educational Review*, 5(1), 17–22. Retrieved from <http://journal.unj.ac.id/unj/index.php/ijer%0APOLICY>
 9. Maulana, S., Supriyono, B., & Hermawan. (2013). Evaluasi Penyediaan Layanan Kesehatan di Daerah Pemekaran Dengan Metode CIPP (Studi pada Pemerintah Daerah Kabupaten Tana Tidung). *Wacana, Jurnal Sosial Dan Humaniora*, 16(4), 186–196. Retrieved from [http://download.portalgaruda.org/article.php?article=272836&val=7123&title=Evaluasi Penyediaan Layanan Kesehatan di Daerah Pemekaran dengan Metode CIPP \(Studi pada Pemerintah Daerah Kabupaten Tana Tidung\)](http://download.portalgaruda.org/article.php?article=272836&val=7123&title=Evaluasi%20Penyediaan%20Layanan%20Kesehatan%20di%20Daerah%20Pemekaran%20dengan%20Metode%20CIPP%20(Studi%20pada%20Pemerintah%20Daerah%20Kabupaten%20Tana%20Tidung))
 10. Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. M. (2013). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. Sage Publication.
 11. Ozolina-Ozola, I. (2014). The Impact of Human Resource Management Practices on Employee Turnover. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 156(April), 223–226. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.11.178>
 12. Stufflebeam, D. L., & Shinkfield, A. J. (2007). Overview of the evaluation field. In *Evaluation Theory, Models, and Applications* (pp. 1–42).